

Snow Loading and Roof Collapse Preparation

As winter approaches, businesses often neglect to plan for roof collapses, one of most serious winter threats. Even a partial roof collapse can deliver devastating property damage, business interruption and possibly loss of life.

When the weight of accumulated snow and ice exceeds the live load capacity of the roof structure, the roof will collapse. Rain falling on accumulated snow is especially dangerous, because it can quickly triple the weight of the snow.

In fact, businesses in warmer U.S. regions may be more susceptible in an unusually severe winter storm, because they are less accustomed to and less prepared for the extreme conditions, and may have building codes that permit lower live-load specifications for roof structures.

Planning, preparation and prompt action to remove accumulated snow will help minimize the risk of snow loading and roof collapse.

Planning and Preparation

- Be sure your Emergency Response Program covers winter emergencies, including appropriate response procedures for excessive snow loads
- Determine the maximum "safe" snow depth for the roof, based on:
 - The roof's live load capacity (indicated by building plans and specifications or by engineering analysis of the roof design)
 - The properties of accumulated snow for the area
- Inspect the roof structure for damage or deterioration, and repair or reinforce it as needed
- Inspect all roof drains and down spouts, and clean any accumulated debris from the roof to prevent clogging of the roof's drainage system
- Look for evidence of roof water ponding and eliminate the causes

When Snow Accumulates

- Regularly monitor snow depth on the roof, paying particular attention to areas where snow tends to drift:
 - 1. In roof valleys, in low roof sections adjacent to higher sections or structures
 - 2. On the downwind side of pitched roofs
 - 3. Against parapets more than two feet high
 - 4. Against penthouses or other large roof structures more than 15 feet wide
- Remove snow accumulations from the roof before the snow reaches 50% of the "safe" maximum depth. Do not send employees onto the roof once the snow load approaches the roof's live-load capacity. Remove snow during a storm only if forecasted snowfall indicates potential dangerous
- Remove snow in layers uniformly across the roof to prevent unbalanced loads, which might cause a collapse
- Clear snow and ice from storm drains and catch basins. Recheck roof drainage system periodically
- Prevent roof cover damage by using care with snow removal equipment (shovels, ice spades, snow blowers, etc.). It is not necessary to clean completely down to the roof surface.

Is Roof Collapse Preventable?

Much of the damage to a building structure can be attributed to an over-loaded roof that fails and collapses. In most cases, roof repair costs are a fraction of the cost to repair building utilities, replace contents and compensate for lost income. A review of recent losses reveals these events may be foreseeable and preventable.

Loss Scenarios

During a 1-week period several snowstorms produced over 20 inches of snow in the central U.S. All three losses identified experienced a structural collapse that interrupted operations.

- On a Sunday evening, a 2,400 sq. ft. roof section collapsed at an idle bottling plant. The collapse severely damaged a main conveyor system and impaired both the electrical supply and the fire protection for the entire facility. The point of collapse was where a 20-foot roofline butted up to a 30-foot-high building section.
- A 125,000 sq. ft. building houses manufacturing and distribution of insulated wire products and power cords. A 4,000 sq. ft. section of the roof collapsed while the facility was idle. There was damage to finished goods and production was interrupted. The point of collapse was where the two building sections joined together. The difference in roof elevation between the two sections was approximately four feet (24 feet vs. 20 feet). Upon investigation it was noted that the estimated snow load on this portion of the building was over twice what the roof structure was designed for.
- A food processor had a portion of its roof collapse in the production area. The collapse damaged processing equipment including a labeling machine, processing tanks and conveyor systems.
- These losses were estimated to exceed \$5 million.

Analysis of Loss

In each of the previous cases, management did not establish or implement an emergency plan that recognized the hazard of snow accumulation or the measures necessary to eliminate excessive snow loads.

All of these losses occurred while the facilities were idle (over the weekend) and no one was present to evaluate the snow accumulation.

All building structures had at least one addition or a portion of the building with a roof height significantly higher or lower than the adjacent building. When additions were built, the building design failed to consider the impact of excessive snow loads on the existing structure where the building sections meet. It is very common for snowdrifts to accumulate on the lower level of multi-level roofs or for snow to slide off a sloped roof onto lower roofs.

Lessons Learned

The following factors could have reduced losses:

- A licensed structural engineer should evaluate any changes or additions to the structure. This would include equipment that is suspended or placed on the roof structure. The concern is to verify that the original snow load design has not been compromised by the additional load placed on the roof by equipment or suspended mechanical structures, i.e., moving cranes, conveyors.
- Adjacent building structures that vary in height need to be evaluated for proper snow load design. Structural roof members of a lower structure immediately adjacent to a higher structure need to be designed for a much greater snow load.
- Developing an emergency plan to include monitoring and possibly removing snow from susceptible roof sections would be an appropriate action during a winter storm. The snow removal plan should be put into effect immediately after snow begins to fall. This plan should be in effect until snow loading is considered acceptable.
- Rooftops should be checked regularly as part of a preventative maintenance program

To learn more about how CNA's Risk Control services can help you manage your risks and increase efficiencies, please contact CNA Risk Control at RiskControl@cna.com or visit cna.com/riskcontrol.

